Turnover of stable carbon isotopes in the muscle, liver, and breath CO$_2$ of alpacas (Lama pacos)

M. Sponheimer$^{1,2,3,*}$, T. F. Robinson$^4$, T. E. Cerling$^{2,5}$, L. Tegland$^4$, B. L. Roeder$^4$, L. Ayliffe$^5$, M. D. Dearing$^1$ and J. R. Ehleringer$^1$

$^1$Department of Anthropology, University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO 80309, USA
$^2$Department of Biology, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT 84112, USA
$^3$Archaeometry Research Unit, Department of Archaeology, University of Cape Town, Private Bag, Rondebosch 7701, South Africa
$^4$Department of Integrative Biology, Brigham Young University, Provo, UT 84602, USA
$^5$Department of Geology and Geophysics, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT 84112, USA

Received 30 December 2005; Revised 21 February 2006; Accepted 25 February 2006

Stable carbon isotope analysis of animal liver and muscle has become a widespread tool for investigating dietary ecology. Nonetheless, stable carbon isotope turnover of these tissues has not been studied in large mammals except with isotopically labelled tracer methodologies, which do not produce carbon half-lives analogous to those derived from naturalistic diet-switch experiments. To address this gap, we studied turnover of carbon isotopes in the liver, muscle, and breath CO$_2$ of alpacas (Lama pacos) by switching them from a C$_3$ grass diet to an isonitrogenous C$_4$ grass diet. Breath samples as well as liver and muscle biopsies were collected and analyzed for up to 72 days to monitor the incorporation of the C$_4$-derived carbon. The data suggest half-lives of 2.8, 37.3, and 178.7 days for alpaca breath CO$_2$, liver, and muscle, respectively. Alpaca liver and muscle carbon half-lives are about 6 times longer than those of gerbils, which is about what would be expected given their size. In contrast, breath CO$_2$ turnover does not scale readily with body mass. We also note that the breath CO$_2$ and liver data are better described using a multiple-pool exponential decay model than a single-pool model. Copyright © 2006 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
examined the carbon isotope turnover in gerbils (Meriones unguiculatus). Although this was an excellent study, its applicability to large animals is questionable given the general, but not absolute trend between tissue turnover/synthesis and mass-specific metabolic rate. Consequently, we would expect stable isotope turnover/synthesis to be much slower in large mammals than in gerbils, as has been observed in studies using artificial tracers. Here, we address this question by presenting the first data on the turnover of stable isotopes in the muscle, liver and breath CO₂ of yearling and adult alpacas (Lama pacos) without the use of artificially labelled tracers.

EXPERIMENTAL

Ten male alpacas, five adults and five yearlings, were fed a C₃ grass diet (Festuca arundinacea) on a small pasture at Brigham Young University for a period of at least 1 year to allow their tissues to equilibrate with their diets. The alpacas were then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ grass (δ¹³C = −25.4 ± 0.4%) (standard deviation), crude protein (CP = 13%) for a 60-day acclimation period. After the acclimation period, they were placed on an isotopically disparate but isonitrogenous C₄ grass (Cynodon dactylon) diet (δ¹³C = −13.6 ± 0.4%o (standard deviation), CP = 13%) for a period of 72 days, after which the experiment was terminated. Food and water were available ad libitum throughout the acclimation and experimental periods.

Breath CO₂, liver, and muscle samples were collected from all individuals just prior to the C₃ to C₄ diet switch (day 0). Further breath and liver samples were collected at 0.25, 0.5, 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 14, 21, and 35 days after the diet switch. Liver samples were collected again at the termination of the experiment (day 72). Muscle samples were collected at the same intervals as liver, only starting at day 3. Breath CO₂ was collected in plastic syringes and passed through an alcohol trap (−50°C) to remove water before being stored in 10-mL head-space vials. Liver and semitendinosus muscle biopsies were collected with biopsy needles, freeze-dried, and then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ plant and on a small pasture at Brigham Young University for a period of at least 1 year to allow their tissues to equilibrate with their diets. The alpacas were then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ grass (δ¹³C = −25.4 ± 0.4%) (standard deviation), crude protein (CP = 13%) for a 60-day acclimation period. After the acclimation period, they were placed on an isotopically disparate but isonitrogenous C₄ grass (Cynodon dactylon) diet (δ¹³C = −13.6 ± 0.4%o (standard deviation), CP = 13%) for a period of 72 days, after which the experiment was terminated. Food and water were available ad libitum throughout the acclimation and experimental periods.

Breath CO₂, liver, and muscle samples were collected from all individuals just prior to the C₃ to C₄ diet switch (day 0). Further breath and liver samples were collected at 0.25, 0.5, 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 14, 21, and 35 days after the diet switch. Liver samples were collected again at the termination of the experiment (day 72). Muscle samples were collected at the same intervals as liver, only starting at day 3. Breath CO₂ was collected in plastic syringes and passed through an alcohol trap (−50°C) to remove water before being stored in 10-mL head-space vials. Liver and semitendinosus muscle biopsies were collected with biopsy needles, freeze-dried, and then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ plant and on a small pasture at Brigham Young University for a period of at least 1 year to allow their tissues to equilibrate with their diets. The alpacas were then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ grass (δ¹³C = −25.4 ± 0.4%) (standard deviation), crude protein (CP = 13%) for a 60-day acclimation period. After the acclimation period, they were placed on an isotopically disparate but isonitrogenous C₄ grass (Cynodon dactylon) diet (δ¹³C = −13.6 ± 0.4%o (standard deviation), CP = 13%) for a period of 72 days, after which the experiment was terminated. Food and water were available ad libitum throughout the acclimation and experimental periods.

Breath CO₂, liver, and muscle samples were collected from all individuals just prior to the C₃ to C₄ diet switch (day 0). Further breath and liver samples were collected at 0.25, 0.5, 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 14, 21, and 35 days after the diet switch. Liver samples were collected again at the termination of the experiment (day 72). Muscle samples were collected at the same intervals as liver, only starting at day 3. Breath CO₂ was collected in plastic syringes and passed through an alcohol trap (−50°C) to remove water before being stored in 10-mL head-space vials. Liver and semitendinosus muscle biopsies were collected with biopsy needles, freeze-dried, and then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ plant and on a small pasture at Brigham Young University for a period of at least 1 year to allow their tissues to equilibrate with their diets. The alpacas were then placed in enclosures and fed a diet based on the same C₃ grass (δ¹³C = −25.4 ± 0.4%) (standard deviation), crude protein (CP = 13%) for a 60-day acclimation period. After the acclimation period, they were placed on an isotopically disparate but isonitrogenous C₄ grass (Cynodon dactylon) diet (δ¹³C = −13.6 ± 0.4%o (standard deviation), CP = 13%) for a period of 72 days, after which the experiment was terminated. Food and water were available ad libitum throughout the acclimation and experimental periods.

Results

ANOVA showed that the stable isotope compositions of adult and yearling breath CO₂, liver, and muscle differed neither on day 0 (just prior to the diet switch) nor on day 72 of the experiment (P > 0.40). As a result, we pooled the data for juveniles and adults for all further analyses. On day 0, liver δ¹³C (x = −25.0 ± 0.1%) was statistically indistinguishable from that of the diet (P = 0.37), while muscle (x = −23.9 ± 0.2%) and breath CO₂ (x = −23.0 ± 2.3%) were enriched by 1.5% and 2.4%, respectively (P < 0.0001). All of these enrichments are similar to those of large ungulates that have been on a single hay diet for their entire lives (Sponheimer, unpublished data), thus we feel that breath CO₂, liver, and muscle stable isotope compositions were largely equilibrated with dietary compositions on day 0 (which was 14 months after the animals began the diet).

As expected, by day 72, liver (x = −18.3 ± 0.6%) and muscle (x = −21.2 ± 0.3%) δ¹³C values were significantly different from day 0 values (P < 0.0001), demonstrating incorporation of carbon from the experimental diet. Indeed, breath CO₂, liver, and muscle δ¹³C differed significantly (P < 0.05) from day 0 values by day 0.5 (x = −19.8 ± 2.9%o (breath CO₂), day 2 (x = −24.4 ± 0.3%o (liver), and day 14 (x = −23.2%o ± 0.3%o (muscle). The liver and muscle data fit single-pool exponential decay models quite well (liver R² = 0.96; muscle R² = 0.99), although the breath CO₂ data fit less well (R² = 0.76; (Figs. 1(a)–(c)). The half-lives for carbon in breath, liver, and muscle are estimated to be 2.8, 37.3, and 178.7 days, respectively.

DISCUSSION

Soft-tissue turnover

It was our goal in this study to determine if carbon isotope turnover in the tissues of alpacas is similar to that in gerbils, or if it is much lower given the large difference in their mass-specific metabolic rates. The soft-tissue half-lives produced here are much longer than those published for birds and gerbils. More specifically, our half-life estimates for both liver and muscle carbon are about 6 times greater than those reported for gerbils (Hliver = 6.4 days; Hmuscle = 27.6 days), and 15 times greater than those for Japanese quail (Hliver = 2.5 days; Hmuscle = 12.4 days). This difference between alpacas and gerbils is consistent

Copyright © 2006 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
DOI: 10.1002/rcm
with the published relationship between whole body protein turnover and body weight in mammals (16.6 body weight (kg)$^{0.74}$ = g/day),$^{25}$ which predicts that gerbil whole body protein turnover (2.95 g/day or 3.0% of body mass/day) should be about five times faster than alpaca whole body protein turnover (312.1 g/day or 0.6% of body mass/day). Thus, it is clear that body mass must be accounted for, and that this should be reasonably simple given the abundant data available on the relationship between body mass and metabolic rate/protein turnover.$^{33–38}$

Contrary to our expectations, we observed no differences in tissue turnover between juveniles and adults. This is probably due to our having used yearlings (1 year old), which had already gained much of their adult body weight, rather than more rapidly growing infants. Had we used younger individuals, differences in tissue turnover rates would almost certainly have been evident. Nonetheless, this negative result is of some significance for wildlife studies, as it suggests that adult and yearling stable isotope compositions will provide dietary information for the same time period, and that age is less of a confounding variable (except for the very young) than was previously supposed.

**Breath CO$_2$ turnover**

We are not aware of any published data on small mammal breath CO$_2$ turnover, but there are data on breath CO$_2$ turnover in birds (for a discussion of breath CO$_2$ enrichment, see$^{39–41}$). Yellow-rumped warblers (*Dendroica coronata*) and pigeons (*Columba livia*) both have breath CO$_2$ half-lives of slightly less than 0.2 days,$^{27,32}$ which is a great deal faster than the equivalent half-life for alpacas (2.8 days). While the much slower breath CO$_2$ turnover in alpacas is at least partially a function of body size, it is also the product of its specialized pseudoruminant digestive system, which allows the digestion of low-quality foods, but at the cost of markedly reduced food intake and passage rates.$^{42–44}$ Indeed, when non-ruminant horses (which are almost ten times heavier than alpacas) were switched from a pure C$_3$ to a pure C$_4$ diet, their breath CO$_2$ half-life was more similar to that of birds than that of alpacas ($\sim$0.8 days; Fig. 1(d)). This is because the mean retention time of alpacas is much longer than that of horses (or these birds), so that alpacas continued to digest significant quantities of the pre-experiment C$_3$ diet for over a week, while the pre-experiment diet was largely eliminated from the digestive system of horses within days. More specifically, the half-life of carbon in horse feces is only 21.5 h, while it is 83.4 h in alpacas (data from Sponheimer, unpublished data), and are consonant with the reported half-life for gerbil hair (47.5 days).$^{23}$

Despite the much slower turnover times reported here, there is an important point of concordance between this and the gerbil and quail studies.$^{23,24}$ In all cases, the muscle to liver carbon turnover ratios (MLCT = muscle half-life/liver half-life) are between 4.3 and 5.0 (Table 1). Thus, it appears that even among animals as taxonomically distinct as gerbils and quail, and as disparate in body size as gerbils and alpacas, liver carbon generally turns over between 4 and 5 times more quickly than muscle carbon. Consequently, it is likely that one can accurately estimate liver turnover for a wide variety of taxa using minimally
invasive muscle biopsies. It would be intriguing to see the degree to which such relationships could be established for other organs.

**Single-pool versus multiple-pool models**

Despite the ubiquity of single-pool exponential decay models in the ecologically oriented stable isotope literature, there are a number of reasons to believe that stable isotope turnover rates are not always best described in this fashion. One reason is that single-pool exponential decay models do not adequately describe some datasets. Schmidt et al. for example, showed that single-pool exponential models provided a very poor fit for $^{13}$C turnover in earthworm (*Lumbricus festivus*) mucus. Secondly, even when single-pool models fit datasets adequately, the data may sometimes be better described using multiple-pool models. For instance, although breath CO$_2$ and hair carbon turnover data equally well ($R^2$ > 0.90), it is better described using three-pool models.

Applying multiple-exponential models as described in Ayliffe et al. demonstrates that the same is true for at least some of the data presented here. The alpaca breath CO$_2$ data are much better described using a three-pool model ($R^2 = 0.99$) than a single-pool model ($R^2 = 0.73$) (Table 1). As can be seen in Fig. 2(a), predicted $^{13}$C values using the single-pool model are depleted by ~2‰ compared with observed values on day 1, yet enriched by nearly 2‰ on day 3. Thus, the single-pool model significantly underestimates isotopic change early in the experiment, but then overestimates the pace of change shortly thereafter. The multiple-pool model, in contrast, recognizes three separate pools contributing to $^{13}$C with half-lives of 0.4, 10, and 26 days, respectively (with fractions of 46%, 19%, and 35% in turn), and its predicted values never differ from observed values by more than 0.6‰, and usually differ by much less.

### Table 1. Half-life and muscle/liver carbon turnover ratio (MLCT) data from this and previous studies. Single-pool half-life (SPHL) calculations are in days. Multiple-pool halflives (their fractions are in parentheses) are also in days. No multiple-pool data presented for Ref. 24 because raw data were not included in the publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SPHL Pool 1</th>
<th>Pool 2</th>
<th>Pool 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tieszen et al.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerbil liver</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerbil muscle</td>
<td>27.6</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLCT</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hobson and Clark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quail liver</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quail muscle</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLCT</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayliffe et al.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horse hair</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horse breath</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLCT</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpaca liver</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpaca muscle</td>
<td>178.7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpaca breath</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLCT</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This result is similar to that of one of our previous studies, in which we found three pools contributing to horse breath CO$_2$ with half-lives of 0.2, 3, and 30 days (with fractions of 67%, 17%, and 16%), although, as expected given the differences in digestive physiology, the fast turnover pools were even faster in horses. As we discussed at some length in the horse study, the strong fit for the three-pool model is to be expected given the contribution from slow (e.g., muscle), intermediate (e.g., spleen), and fast (e.g., bicarbonate) turnover pools to breath CO$_2$.

The alpaca liver $^{13}$C data are also better described using a two-pool ($R^2 = 0.99$) than a one-pool model ($R^2 = 0.90$) (Table 1), but single- and multiple-pool models describe the muscle turnover data equally well ($R^2 > 0.99$), with residuals never exceeding 0.2‰. Multiple-pool models may also better fit data from some previous studies than do single-pool models. For instance, liver $^{13}$C data from Tieszen et al. fit a multiple-pool model ($R^2 = 0.99$) better than a model with only a single pool ($R^2 = 0.93$) (Table 1; Fig. 2(b)). The single-pool model predicted values differing from the observed values by as much as 1.6‰ by day 40, whereas residuals for a two-pool model (with half-lives of 3.4 and 35 days, both faster and slower than the 6.4 days previously reported) never exceed 0.2‰. In fact, we have found that when higher-resolution data are available, protein turnover is, not surprisingly, better described by a three-pool model, which is also consistent with the findings of isotope-labelling studies.

Detailed information on muscle, liver, and breath stable isotope turnover is necessary if they are to be used to good

---

**Figure 2.** (a) Alpaca liver $^{13}$C from day 0 to day 35 of the experiment. Observed values appear as circles and predicted values from single- and multiple-pool models are shown as stars and crosses, respectively. (b) Gerbil liver $^{13}$C data from Tieszen et al., with markers as above.
effect as dietary archives. Although at present single-pool exponential decay models are the standard for describing stable isotope turnover, in some cases multiple-pool models may be more physiologically revealing and accurate. This increase in accuracy is extremely important for wildlife applications where trophic behavior is reconstructed from high-resolution dietary archives such as tail hair.12 However, proper application of these models requires knowledge of the precise nature of each pool in vivo, lest we sacrifice biological reality for mathematical contrivance. Thus, additional studies designed to better our understanding of what each pool represents are warranted.

Until that time, comparisons of half-lives estimated using single-pool models do allow for simple and useful comparison of intraspecific (within a species) and interspecific (between species) stable isotope turnover. For instance, we have shown here that the half-lives of carbon in alpaca liver and muscle are about 6 times greater than those in gerbils, and about 15 times greater than those in Japanese quail. This finding has important implications for dietary interpretation of liver and muscle δ13C in large mammals. Approximately 90% of an animal’s dietary stable isotope composition will be reflected in its tissues within 3 half-lives. Thus, quail and gerbil muscle carbon will largely reflect dietary carbon isotope compositions within ~40 and ~80 days, respectively. The alpaca data suggest, however, that large mammal muscle carbon will not reflect 90% of a new dietary signal until a period of well over a year. Thus, while quail and gerbil muscle can be readily used to investigate short-term dietary change (~1 to 3 months), the δ13C of large mammal muscle will be relatively insensitive to short-term dietary change, rather reflecting long-term dietary averages. From a practical standpoint, this means that one cannot assume that similar methods can be used to investigate the dietary ecology of large and small taxa. For instance, if one is interested in investigating an animal’s recent diet, muscle might well be appropriate when studying rodents, but not when studying larger mammals. Nevertheless, it appears that large mammal liver and small mammal muscle integrate dietary information over a similar period, and might be fruitfully juxtaposed when attempting to study recent trophic behavior in mammalian communities. Future studies of other dietary archives (e.g., plasma lipids) through the use of compound-specific techniques (GC/C/IRMS) should make it possible to address ecological questions at even shorter temporal scales.

Acknowledgements
We thank C. Cook, M. Lott, and B. Passey for help with the mass spectrometers, a host of BYU students for help with the alpacas, and two anonymous reviewers for their comments on the manuscript. This research was funded by Brigham Young University and the Packard Foundation.

REFERENCES

Stable carbon isotope analysis of alpaca tissue 1399